

SENATE RECORD VOTE ANALYSIS

105th Congress
2nd Session

Vote No. 258

September 2, 1998, 5:49 p.m.
Page S-9860 Temp. Record

FOREIGN OPERATIONS APPROPRIATIONS/Access to Classified Information

SUBJECT: Foreign Operations, Export Financing, and Related Programs Appropriations Bill for FY 1999 . . . S. 2334.
McConnell/Shelby motion to table the Dodd amendment No. 3527.

ACTION: MOTION TO TABLE AGREED TO, 50-43

SYNOPSIS: As reported, S. 2334, the Foreign Operations, Export Financing, and Related Programs Appropriations Bill for fiscal year 1999, will provide a total of \$12.6 billion in new budget authority for foreign aid programs. Also, it will provide \$17.9 billion in supplemental fiscal year (FY) 1998 funds for the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and \$310.7 million in such funds in "arrearages" to multilateral institutions. The IMF budget authority, as permitted by the Budget Agreement, will not be counted under the budget authority caps. IMF outlays are never scored under the outlay caps. Thus, this spending will be "off-budget." See vote Nos. 44 and 256 for related debate.

The Dodd amendment would require Federal agencies to review for possible declassification all documents requested by the Guatemala Clarification Commission and the National Human Rights Commissioner of Honduras. Instead of using the normal standards and procedures for declassifying documents, and which are designed to protect intelligence sources and methods, agencies would be required to use the much less secure standards and procedures that have been created for declassifying documents related to the Kennedy assassination (those documents are nearly 40 years old, and therefore raise fewer security issues; some of the documents covered by the Dodd amendment are only 1 year old). Further, agencies would have to complete the process within 120 days. Americans who alleged that humans rights abuses had been committed against them in those two countries would also have their declassification requests reviewed under these standards and procedures.

During debate, Senator McConnell, for himself and Senator Shelby, moved to table the Dodd amendment. A motion to table is not debatable; however, some debate preceded the making of the motion. Generally, those favoring the motion to table opposed the amendment; those opposing the motion to table favored the amendment.

Those favoring the motion to table contended:

(See other side)

YEAS (50)		NAYS (43)		NOT VOTING (7)	
Republicans (50 or 98%)	Democrats (0 or 0%)	Republicans (1 or 2%)	Democrats (42 or 100%)	Republicans (4)	Democrats (3)
Abraham	Hutchinson	Jeffords	Akaka	Kennedy	Coverdell- ²
Allard	Hutchison		Baucus	Kerrey	Domenici- ²
Ashcroft	Inhofe		Biden	Kerry	Glenn- ²
Bennett	Kempthorne		Boxer	Kohl	Helms- ^{3AY}
Bond	Kyl		Breaux	Landrieu	Murkowski- ²
Brownback	Lott		Bryan	Lautenberg	
Burns	Lugar		Bumpers	Leahy	
Campbell	Mack		Byrd	Levin	
Chafee	McCain		Cleland	Lieberman	
Coats	McConnell		Conrad	Mikulski	
Cochran	Nickles		Daschle	Moseley-Braun	
Collins	Roberts		Dodd	Moynihan	
Craig	Roth		Dorgan	Murray	
D'Amato	Santorum		Durbin	Reed	
DeWine	Sessions		Feingold	Reid	
Enzi	Shelby		Feinstein	Robb	
Faircloth	Smith, Bob		Ford	Rockefeller	
Frist	Smith, Gordon		Graham	Sarbanes	
Gorton	Snowe		Harkin	Torricelli	
Gramm	Specter		Hollings	Wellstone	
Grams	Stevens		Johnson	Wyden	
Grassley	Thomas				
Gregg	Thompson				
Hagel	Thurmond				
Hatch	Warner				

EXPLANATION OF ABSENCE:

- 1—Official Business
- 2—Necessarily Absent
- 3—Illness
- 4—Other

SYMBOLS:

- AY—Announced Yea
- AN—Announced Nay
- PY—Paired Yea
- PN—Paired Nay

Our colleagues' motives are admirable, but that fact does not excuse the harm that would come from the enactment of their amendment. First, this amendment would give extraordinary and unprecedented statutory privileges to foreign organizations to compel the disclosure of classified national security information. Second, it would give them the right to compel that disclosure within a very short period of time--4 months. Agencies would have to divert a large number of personnel and funds from their normal tasks (including declassification requests from American citizens) to complete the required reviews. Third, it would put at risk the lives of people who secretly helped the United States in its efforts to bring democracy to Guatemala and Honduras. The standard that would be used by the Dodd amendment is a special, lenient standard that was developed solely for use with information that might relate to the President Kennedy assassination, which occurred nearly 40 y